

BENCHMARKING

JURNAL MANAJEMEN PENDIDIKAN ISLAM

EVALUATION OF AN ISLAMIC VALUES–BASED PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL SYSTEM FOR EDUCATIONAL PERSONNEL IN MADRASAH ALIYAH TO IMPROVE THE QUALITY OF EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

Mawardi^{1(*)}, Fatmi Ramlah², Muslimin³, Mariana⁴

^{1,2,3,4}Universitas Islam Sarolangun Jambi

mawardimohamedamru@gmail.com¹, fatmiramlah1998@mail.com²,

musliminnq@gmail.com³, marianaamrullah96@gmail.com⁴

Received: 23-11-2025

Revised: 25-11-2025

Accepted: 25-12-2025

Abstract

Performance appraisal of educational personnel plays a strategic role in ensuring service quality and institutional accountability in educational organizations. In Madrasah Aliyah Negeri (MAN), however, performance appraisal practices for non-teaching staff are often conducted informally and are weakly integrated with Islamic value-based management principles. This study aims to evaluate the performance appraisal system for educational personnel in Madrasah Aliyah Negeri based on Islamic values and to examine its implications for improving educational service quality. Employing a qualitative evaluative approach, the study was conducted in a Madrasah Aliyah Negeri in Sarolangun Regency, Jambi Province. Data were collected through in-depth interviews, document analysis, and non-participant observation involving educational personnel and institutional leaders, and were analyzed thematically. The findings reveal that Islamic values such as *amanah* (trustworthiness), justice (*‘adl*), responsibility (*mas’uliyah*), and *ihsan* (excellence) are present mainly as implicit moral expectations rather than as formal performance indicators within the appraisal system. Performance evaluation practices rely heavily on leadership supervision, lack standardized instruments, and are weakly linked to systematic follow-up actions for service quality improvement. As a result, performance appraisal contributes to short-term behavioral compliance but has limited impact on sustainable service quality and quality assurance mechanisms. This study concludes that strengthening educational service quality in MAN requires a formalized, standardized, and value-integrated performance appraisal system. By operationalizing Islamic values as measurable performance constructs and aligning appraisal outcomes with quality assurance processes, performance appraisal can function as a strategic instrument for continuous service improvement in Islamic secondary education institutions.

Keywords: performance appraisal, educational personnel, Islamic values, service quality, Madrasah Aliyah Negeri

(*) Corresponding Author:

Mawardi, mawardimohamedamru@gmail.com, 082378979696

INTRODUCTION

Performance appraisal of educational personnel constitutes a strategic component of human resource management in educational institutions, as it directly influences service effectiveness, organizational accountability, and continuous quality improvement. Within contemporary performance management theory, appraisal systems are no longer viewed as administrative routines but as structured managerial mechanisms designed to align individual performance with institutional objectives, support professional development, and inform evidence-based decision-making (Aguinis, 2019; Armstrong, 2021; Wibowo, 2017). In educational organizations, particularly at the secondary education level, the role

of educational personnel extends beyond technical administration to encompass frontline service delivery that significantly shapes stakeholders' perceptions of institutional credibility, effectiveness, and quality (Sallis, 2014; Bush & Coleman, 2012; Widodo, 2021).

Within Islamic educational institutions, performance management is inseparable from ethical and normative foundations derived from Islamic values. Madrasahs, as faith-based institutions, are institutionally mandated to integrate values such as *amanah* (trustworthiness), *adl* (justice), *mas'uliyah* (responsibility), and *ihsan* (excellence) into organizational governance, human resource management, and performance appraisal systems (Muhaimin, 2019; Nata, 2020; Hafidhuddin & Tanjung, 2019). These values function not merely as moral ideals but as guiding principles that shape work behavior, professional integrity, accountability, and service orientation (Azra, 2019; Rahmawati & Suyatno, 2020). Within the framework of Islamic Educational Human Resource Management (IEHRM), values are expected to operate as behavioral standards that inform performance indicators, appraisal mechanisms, and follow-up actions, thereby aligning ethical commitments with managerial effectiveness (Arifin & Setiawan, 2021; Hakim, 2022).

The urgency of evaluating performance appraisal systems is particularly evident in Madrasah Aliyah Negeri (MAN), which operate within a formal bureaucratic structure under the Ministry of Religious Affairs. In principle, MAN possess organizational structures, job classifications, and administrative procedures that enable systematic performance management and accountability. However, empirical studies consistently indicate that the management of educational and administrative personnel in madrasahs faces challenges related to unclear performance standards, inconsistent evaluation practices, limited documentation, and weak linkages between appraisal outcomes and professional development programs (Nurlindah et al., 2020; Rohman, 2023; Sulaiman & Huda, 2021). Under such conditions, performance appraisal risks functioning merely as a procedural formality rather than as a strategic instrument for enhancing educational service quality and institutional governance.

Previous research in Islamic education management has predominantly focused on teacher performance, instructional leadership, and total quality management frameworks, while the performance appraisal of educational personnel has received comparatively limited scholarly attention (Sallis, 2014; Nurlindah et al., 2020; Rahman et al., 2022). Moreover, studies that address Islamic values in management practices frequently remain at the normative or conceptual level, without critically examining how these values are embedded within appraisal indicators, assessment mechanisms, and follow-up processes (Muhaimin, 2019; Arifin & Setiawan, 2021; Zainuddin & Hasan, 2022). This limitation highlights a significant research gap concerning the evaluation of performance appraisal systems for educational personnel that explicitly integrate Islamic values and link appraisal outcomes to service quality improvement and quality assurance mechanisms.

Therefore, this study aims to evaluate the performance appraisal system for educational personnel in Madrasah Aliyah Negeri based on Islamic values and its implications for improving educational service quality. Specifically, the study seeks to: (1) examine the structure and implementation of the performance appraisal system for educational personnel, including appraisal planning, indicators, assessors, periodicity, documentation, and follow-up mechanisms; (2) analyze the extent to which Islamic values (*amanah*, justice, responsibility, and *ihsan*) are integrated into appraisal indicators and practices; and (3) assess the implications of the appraisal system for the quality of educational services. By addressing these objectives, the study contributes theoretically to Islamic Educational Human Resource Management, particularly within the sub-domain of educational performance evaluation, and practically provides evidence-based

recommendations for strengthening value-based performance appraisal systems in madrasahs (Arifin & Setiawan, 2021; Hakim, 2022; Mulyadi & Widodo, 2023).

From a policy perspective, the management and evaluation of educational personnel performance in Madrasah Aliyah Negeri are framed by national regulations governing educational administration, accountability, and internal quality assurance. Indonesian education policy emphasizes performance-based management and continuous quality improvement across all categories of educational human resources, including non-teaching staff. Within the madrasah system, educational personnel are formally tasked with supporting academic services, data governance, student administration, and institutional compliance with national education standards. However, policy implementation studies indicate that performance evaluation mechanisms for educational personnel often remain underdeveloped, fragmented, or weakly institutionalized, particularly when compared to teacher appraisal systems (Wibowo, 2017; Rohman, 2023; Sukardi & Laili, 2024). As a result, policy mandates related to accountability and service quality are not always translated into coherent appraisal instruments that guide daily administrative practices and long-term human resource development.

In the specific context of Madrasah Aliyah Negeri, performance appraisal systems operate at the intersection of bureaucratic governance and Islamic institutional values. MAN function simultaneously as public educational institutions and as Islamic organizations with moral and religious mandates that distinguish them from general secondary schools. This dual character places additional demands on performance appraisal systems, which must balance formal administrative compliance with value-based expectations rooted in Islamic ethics. Empirical evidence suggests that, in many MAN, performance appraisal practices for educational personnel are conducted informally through supervisory monitoring and leadership judgment, without standardized instruments or explicit integration of Islamic values into measurable indicators (Nurlindah et al., 2020; Arifin & Setiawan, 2021; Rofiq & Hamzah, 2024). Consequently, the absence of a structured, value-integrated appraisal framework limits the capacity of MAN to systematically enhance service quality and to position performance appraisal as a strategic managerial tool rather than a procedural obligation.

This study offers a distinctive contribution to the field of Islamic Education Management by moving beyond normative discussions of value-based management toward an evaluative analysis of how Islamic values are operationalized within a formal performance appraisal system for educational personnel. Unlike prior studies that predominantly examine teacher performance, leadership styles, or abstract ethical frameworks, this research focuses explicitly on the appraisal system of non-teaching educational staff in Madrasah Aliyah Negeri and examines its structural components, value integration mechanisms, and service quality implications in an integrated manner. By positioning Islamic values (*amanah*, justice, responsibility, and *ihsan*) as evaluative performance dimensions rather than symbolic ideals, this study bridges the gap between normative Islamic principles and practical performance management. Furthermore, by linking appraisal system evaluation to educational service quality outcomes, the study advances empirical understanding of performance-based quality improvement within Islamic secondary education institutions and provides an analytical model that can inform policy refinement and managerial practice across comparable madrasah contexts.

RESEARCH METHOD

Research Design

This study employed a qualitative descriptive approach with a case study design. The qualitative approach was selected to enable an in-depth evaluation of the performance appraisal system for educational personnel, particularly in examining how Islamic values

are integrated into appraisal practices and how the system functions in relation to educational service quality. A case study design was considered appropriate because it allows for a contextual and holistic understanding of organizational practices within a specific institutional setting, rather than measuring variables in isolation. This research was conducted at the State Islamic Senior High School (MAN) located in Sarolangun Regency, Jambi Province, Indonesia.

The research subjects include: 1) Madrasah principals or deputy madrasah principals responsible for administrative matters, 2) Heads of administrative services, 3) Teaching staff such as administrative staff, data operators, or library staff, and 4) Individuals involved in monitoring or evaluating teaching staff performance. Data collection techniques include: 1) Interviews, Document analysis and 3) Observation.

Data analysis followed an interactive thematic analysis process, which consisted of data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions. To ensure the trustworthiness of the data, this study applied triangulation of sources and techniques. Data obtained from interviews were cross-checked with observational findings and documentary evidence to enhance credibility and consistency. Member checking was also conducted selectively to confirm the accuracy of key interpretations.

RESEARCH RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Research Results

1. Implementation of the Educational Personnel Performance Appraisal System

The findings indicate that the performance appraisal system for educational personnel at *Madrasah Aliyah Negeri* has been implemented primarily as an administrative practice rather than as a formally structured performance management system. Performance appraisal is conducted through routine supervision by madrasah leadership and the head of administrative services, focusing on general aspects of work behavior such as discipline, task completion, responsibility, and service responsiveness.

Overall, the implementation of the performance appraisal system reflects an implicit managerial practice that relies heavily on leadership judgment rather than a systematic, documented framework. A summary of the key components of the performance appraisal system is presented in Table 1.

Table 1.
Components Of The Educational Personnel Performance Appraisal System

NO.	Performance Appraisal Component	Practice In Man	Description
1	Appraisal Planning	Partially Available	No Comprehensive Written Appraisal Guidelines
2	Performance Indicators	General And Non-Standardized	Focus On Discipline, Responsibility, And Service Behavior
3	Appraisers	Madrasah Principal And Head Of Administration	No Formal Appraisal Team
4	Appraisal Frequency	Incidental	No Fixed Or Periodic Appraisal Schedule
5	Follow-Up Actions	Informal Coaching	Limited Documentation And Monitoring

Source: Research Data (2024)

2. Integration of Islamic Values in Performance Appraisal Practices

The results show that Islamic values are integrated into the performance appraisal system implicitly rather than explicitly. Values such as *amanah* (trustworthiness), justice, responsibility, and *ihsan* (excellence) are embedded in daily work expectations and

leadership supervision practices. Educational personnel are expected to demonstrate honesty, discipline, fairness in service delivery, and a sense of responsibility toward students, teachers, and institutional duties.

However, these values are not formally translated into measurable appraisal indicators or assessment instruments. Instead, they function as moral benchmarks used informally by leaders when evaluating staff behavior and service quality. As a result, the application of Islamic values in performance appraisal depends largely on the subjective interpretation of the appraisers rather than on standardized criteria.

This condition indicates a gap between the normative commitment to Islamic values and their operationalization within the appraisal system. While values guide work culture and expectations, the absence of formal indicators limits their consistency and evaluative function in the performance appraisal process.

3. Implications of Performance Appraisal for Educational Service Quality

Despite its informal nature, the existing performance appraisal practice has observable implications for educational service quality. Informants reported that leadership supervision and appraisal practices contribute to improved discipline, timeliness, and responsiveness in administrative services. Educational personnel tend to be more attentive to service accuracy and procedural compliance, particularly in tasks related to student administration, academic documentation, and data management.

Improvements in service quality are reflected in faster service delivery, clearer administrative procedures, and better coordination between administrative staff and academic units. Nevertheless, the impact of performance appraisal on service quality remains inconsistent, as follow-up actions such as structured feedback, professional development, or service improvement planning are not systematically implemented.

The findings suggest that while informal appraisal practices can generate short-term behavioral improvements, their contribution to sustainable service quality enhancement is constrained by the absence of a structured appraisal system and documented follow-up mechanisms.

4. Overview of the Performance Appraisal System Flow

To provide a clearer understanding of how the performance appraisal system operates in practice, Figure 1 illustrates the general flow of the educational personnel performance appraisal system at *Madrasah Aliyah Negeri*, highlighting the integration of Islamic values and its relationship with service quality improvement.



Source: Researcher's analysis (2024)

Figure 1.

Flow of the Educational Personnel Performance Appraisal System Based on Islamic Values

Discussion

Islamic Values as Performance Constructs in Educational Personnel Appraisal

The findings of this study indicate that Islamic values—*amanah*, justice (*'adl*), responsibility (*mas'uliyah*), and *ihsan*—are embedded within performance appraisal practices primarily as implicit moral expectations rather than as formal evaluative constructs. From the perspective of Islamic Educational Human Resource Management (IEHRM), this condition reflects a recurring pattern in faith-based educational institutions, where ethical values are strongly internalized within organizational culture but remain weakly institutionalized in formal managerial systems (Muhaimin, 2019; Nata, 2020; Hafidhuddin & Tanjung, 2019). While cultural internalization of values contributes positively to ethical awareness and moral conduct, performance management theory consistently emphasizes that values must be translated into observable behaviors, measurable indicators, and standardized criteria to function effectively within appraisal systems (Aguinis, 2019; Armstrong, 2021; Wibowo, 2017). Without such translation, value-based appraisal risks becoming symbolic rather than evaluative, thereby limiting its capacity to guide performance improvement, accountability, and professional development.

Conceptually, each Islamic value examined in this study can be positioned as a distinct performance construct with concrete managerial implications. *Amanah* may be operationalized as trust-based accountability, reflected in accuracy of administrative work, data integrity, compliance with service procedures, and consistency in fulfilling assigned responsibilities. In performance management literature, trustworthiness and accountability are recognized as foundational elements of reliable service delivery and organizational credibility (Zeithaml et al., 1996; Aguinis, 2019). Justice (*'adl*) corresponds to fairness and objectivity in service provision, including equal treatment of service users, consistency in applying rules, and transparency in administrative decision-making. Studies on educational service management demonstrate that perceived fairness significantly influences stakeholder trust and satisfaction, particularly in bureaucratic educational institutions (Sallis, 2014; Badrudin et al., 2022).

Performance Appraisal, Service Quality, and Quality Assurance in Madrasah Aliyah Negeri

The findings of this study demonstrate that the performance appraisal system for educational personnel in Madrasah Aliyah Negeri (MAN) has a tangible relationship with educational service quality, albeit in a limited and inconsistent manner. Informal appraisal practices conducted through leadership supervision contribute to improvements in basic service attributes such as discipline, responsiveness, and procedural compliance. This finding aligns with service quality theory, which emphasizes that staff performance constitutes a critical determinant of service reliability, assurance, and stakeholder satisfaction (Parasuraman et al., 1988; Zeithaml et al., 1990; Zeithaml et al., 1996). In educational institutions—particularly those characterized by complex administrative processes—non-teaching staff performance plays a strategic role in shaping the effectiveness of academic services, institutional credibility, and internal coordination (Sallis, 2014; Bush & Coleman, 2012; Prasetyo & Munadi, 2022).

Despite these positive contributions, the absence of a structured and standardized appraisal system significantly limits the capacity of performance evaluation to function as an instrument of systematic quality assurance. Educational quality assurance frameworks require clearly defined service standards, consistent monitoring mechanisms, documented evaluation processes, and feedback loops that support continuous improvement (Sallis, 2014; Harvey & Green, 1993). In the context of MAN, appraisal practices that are incidental, undocumented, and largely discretionary hinder the establishment of service

benchmarks and weaken the linkage between performance evaluation and institutional quality objectives. Similar patterns have been reported in previous empirical studies, which indicate that weak or informal performance appraisal systems in madrasahs often result in fragmented quality assurance practices and reactive, problem-driven service management rather than preventive and improvement-oriented approaches (Nurlindah et al., 2020; Rohman, 2023; Sulaiman & Huda, 2021).

From a quality assurance perspective, performance appraisal should function as an internal control mechanism that informs service standardization, risk mitigation, and continuous service improvement. Performance management literature emphasizes that appraisal systems become effective quality assurance tools only when evaluation results are systematically analyzed, documented, and linked to corrective and developmental actions, such as procedural refinement, staff coaching, competency development, and service innovation (Aguinis, 2019; Armstrong, 2021; Wibowo, 2017).

Institutional Risks of Informal and Non-Standardized Performance Appraisal

The reliance on informal and non-standardized performance appraisal practices, as identified in this study, presents multiple institutional risks for Madrasah Aliyah Negeri (MAN), particularly in relation to fairness, accountability, and governance sustainability. One primary risk concerns subjectivity in evaluation, where appraisal outcomes are shaped predominantly by individual leadership perceptions rather than by agreed-upon standards and evidence-based indicators. Performance management theory consistently cautions that subjective appraisal systems reduce reliability, inter-rater consistency, and perceived fairness, thereby undermining employee trust in the evaluation process (Aguinis, 2019; Armstrong, 2021; DeNisi & Murphy, 2017). In educational institutions, such subjectivity may lead to perceptions of bias, unequal treatment, and ambiguity regarding performance expectations, which can weaken organizational commitment, motivation, and professional identity among educational personnel (Bush & Coleman, 2012; Prasetyo & Munadi, 2022).

Furthermore, non-standardized appraisal systems pose significant risks to accountability and quality assurance mechanisms. Without clear performance indicators, documented evaluation outcomes, and traceable appraisal records, performance results cannot be systematically audited, compared across time periods, or integrated into institutional quality assurance cycles. Quality assurance frameworks emphasize the importance of evidence-based monitoring, documentation, and feedback loops to ensure continuous improvement and compliance with organizational standards (Sallis, 2014; Harvey & Green, 1993). In the absence of standardized appraisal documentation, MAN may encounter difficulties in demonstrating accountability in administrative performance, particularly in relation to service delivery, internal audits, and external evaluations conducted by supervisory authorities. This condition limits the role of performance appraisal as an internal control mechanism and weakens its contribution to institutional governance and risk management (Aguinis, 2019; Pranata, 2023).

Contribution to Islamic Educational Human Resource Management and Performance Evaluation Literature

This study contributes to the literature on Islamic Educational Human Resource Management (IEHRM) by advancing an evaluative and practice-oriented understanding of performance appraisal systems for educational personnel, a group that has remained relatively underrepresented in prior Islamic education research. Existing studies in Islamic education management have predominantly focused on teacher performance, instructional leadership, school culture, and curriculum implementation, often marginalizing the strategic role of non-teaching staff in shaping institutional effectiveness and service quality (Sallis, 2014; Bush & Coleman, 2012; Nurlindah et al., 2020). By explicitly positioning

educational personnel as the unit of analysis, this study broadens the analytical scope of IEHRM scholarship and underscores the importance of administrative and support staff as key actors in the delivery of educational services and organizational governance within madrasahs.

Conceptually, this study enriches IEHRM by reframing Islamic values as operational performance constructs rather than abstract ethical ideals. Prior literature frequently positions values such as *amanah*, justice (*'adl*), responsibility (*mas'uliyah*), and *ihsan* as normative foundations of Islamic organizations without sufficiently articulating their managerial and evaluative functions (Muhaimin, 2019; Nata, 2020; Azra, 2019). This study demonstrates that these values can be translated into concrete evaluative dimensions that inform performance indicators, appraisal criteria, and follow-up mechanisms. In doing so, the research bridges a critical gap between normative Islamic ethics and contemporary performance management theory, responding to scholarly calls for more actionable and measurable frameworks in value-based human resource management (Aguinis, 2019; Armstrong, 2021; Arifin & Setiawan, 2021; Hakim, 2022). This contribution moves IEHRM discourse beyond moral exhortation toward an operational paradigm that integrates ethics with managerial accountability.

CONCLUSION

1. The performance appraisal of educational personnel in *Madrasah Aliyah Negeri* is conducted predominantly as an administrative and supervisory practice. Although appraisal activities are present, the system lacks a standardized and documented framework encompassing clear indicators, fixed periodicity, formal instruments, and structured follow-up, which limits its strategic role in performance management.
2. Islamic values—*amanah*, justice, responsibility, and *ihsan*—are embedded implicitly within organizational culture and leadership supervision. However, these values have not been translated into operational performance constructs or measurable appraisal indicators, resulting in subjective assessments and limited evaluative consistency.
3. Informal appraisal practices contribute modestly to improvements in educational service quality, particularly in terms of discipline, responsiveness, and procedural compliance. Nonetheless, the absence of systematic feedback and development mechanisms constrains the sustainability and scalability of service quality enhancement.
4. The reliance on informal and non-standardized appraisal practices generates institutional risks, including subjectivity, inconsistency across time and leadership transitions, and weakened accountability, thereby reducing the effectiveness of performance appraisal as an instrument of quality assurance.
5. Strengthening a standardized, value-integrated performance appraisal system is essential to reposition appraisal from a routine administrative task to a strategic mechanism for educational service quality assurance and institutional governance within Islamic secondary education.

SUGGESTIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS

1. **Formalization of a Standardized Performance Appraisal Framework**
Madrasah Aliyah Negeri are recommended to develop a formal and standardized performance appraisal framework for educational personnel, including clear performance indicators, appraisal instruments, fixed appraisal schedules, and documented procedures. This framework should function as an integral component of institutional quality assurance rather than as an incidental administrative practice.
2. **Operational Integration of Islamic Values into Appraisal Indicators**
Islamic values such as *amanah*, justice, responsibility, and *ihsan* should be translated into measurable performance indicators and behavioral descriptors. By

operationalizing these values within appraisal instruments, madrasahs can ensure that ethical principles are consistently and objectively reflected in performance evaluation practices.

3. **Linkage between Appraisal Results and Capacity Development Programs**
Performance appraisal outcomes should be systematically connected to structured follow-up actions, including feedback sessions, coaching, service improvement planning, and competency development programs for educational personnel. This linkage is essential to transform appraisal results into sustainable improvements in educational service quality.
4. **Policy Support and Supervisory Guidance from Educational Authorities**
Educational authorities, particularly within the Ministry of Religious Affairs, are encouraged to provide policy guidance and supervisory support for the implementation of value-based performance appraisal systems. Such support may include the issuance of technical guidelines, training for madrasah leaders, and monitoring mechanisms to ensure consistency and accountability across institutions.

REFERENCES

- Aguinis, H. (2019). *Performance management* (4th ed.). Chicago, IL: Chicago Business Press.
- Armstrong, M. (2021). *Armstrong's handbook of performance management* (7th ed.). London: Kogan Page.
- Arifin, Z., & Setiawan, D. (2021). Islamic-based HRM in educational institutions. *Al-Tanzim*, 5(2), 120–134. <https://doi.org/10.33650/al-tanzim.v5i2.2254>
- Azra, A. (2019). *Pendidikan Islam: Tradisi dan modernisasi*. Jakarta: Kencana.
- Badrudin, B., Saepudin, A., & Nurlaeli, A. (2022). Educational service quality in Islamic schools. *Al-Tanzim*, 6(1), 45–59. <https://doi.org/10.33650/al-tanzim.v6i1.3189>
- Beekun, R. I. (2012). *Islamic business ethics*. IIT.
- Bush, T., & Coleman, M. (2012). *Leadership and strategic management in education*. Sage.
- DeNisi, A. S., & Murphy, K. R. (2017). Performance appraisal: 100 years of progress. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 102(3), 421–433. <https://doi.org/10.1037/apl0000085>
- Harvey, L., & Green, D. (1993). Defining quality. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 18(1), 9–34.
- Hakim, L. (2022). Islamic HRM framework. *Al-Tanzim*, 6(1), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.33650/al-tanzim.v6i1.3101>
- Hidayat, R., & Machali, I. (2021). *Manajemen mutu pendidikan Islam*. Ar-Ruzz Media.
- Iqbal, Q., Ahmad, N. H., & Allen, M. (2020). Performance appraisal in public sector. *Public Management Review*, 22(11), 1681–1702.
- Muhaimin. (2019). *Manajemen pendidikan Islam*. Kencana.
- Nata, A. (2020). *Manajemen pendidikan Islam*. Prenadamedia.
- Nurlindah, N., Rahman, A., & Sulaiman, S. (2020). Educational personnel management. *Al-Idarah*, 10(2), 233–247.
- Owlia, M. S., & Aspinwall, E. (1996). Quality in higher education. *Quality Assurance in Education*, 4(2), 12–20.