



POST-BASIC TRAINING EVALUATION FOR CIVIL SERVANT CANDIDATES: ANALYSIS OF ANEKA VALUE IMPLEMENTATION IN IMPROVING PUBLIC SERVICE QUALITY AT THE MINISTRY OF RELIGIOUS AFFAIRS OF NORTH SUMATRA PROVINCE

Mahmun Syarif

Balai Pendidikan dan Pelatihan Keagamaan Medan, Indonesia

Email: mahmuns@gmail.com

Corresponding Author: mahmuns@gmail.com

Keywords

*Post-Training Evaluation;
CPNS Basic Training;
ANEKA;
Public Services;
Kirkpatrick Model;*

Abstract

Basic Training (Latsar) for Civil Servant Candidates (CPNS) constitutes a strategic policy instrument designed to internalize the core values of the state civil apparatus in order to promote the continuous improvement of public service quality. This study aims to evaluate the sustainability of the implementation of the ANEKA core values Accountability, Nationalism, Public Ethics, Quality Commitment, and Anti-Corruption among alumni of the 2019 Batch of Group III CPNS Basic Training within the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of North Sumatra Province. Employing a qualitative approach grounded in Kirkpatrick's training evaluation model at Level 3 (Job Behaviour) and Level 4 (Results), this study critically examines the strategic roles of coaches and mentors, as well as the use of information technology, in facilitating the transfer of training. The study involved 310 informants selected through purposive sampling, comprising Latsar alumni, colleagues, mentors or immediate supervisors, heads of work units, and coaches from the Medan Religious Education and Training Centre. Data were collected through in-depth structured interviews, participatory observation in public service units, and document analysis of actualization reports. Data were analysed using the interactive model developed by Miles and Huberman. The findings indicate that, although participants' actualization performance during the training was assessed as highly satisfactory, the consistency and sustainability of its implementation declined significantly after the participants were formally appointed as full civil servants. This decline was attributed to weak post-training monitoring systems, limited continuous guidance from mentors, and the strong influence of conventional workplace cultures, particularly seniority. The optimization of information technology and the strengthening of organizational commitment were identified as key determinants in maintaining the sustainability of public service quality.

E-ISSN: 2541-5263

P-ISSN: 1411-4380



This is an open access article under the [CC BY-SA](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/) license

1. INTRODUCTION

Bureaucratic transformation requires state civil apparatus personnel not only to possess technical competencies but also to demonstrate integrity, a service-oriented mindset, adaptability, and responsibility for achieving organizational performance. These requirements have become increasingly important as the public expects services that are rapid, transparent, inclusive, and responsive to



technological developments. Law Number 20 of 2023 concerning the State Civil Apparatus stipulates that ASN personnel serve as implementers of public policy and providers of public services who must perform their duties professionally, remain free from political intervention, and uphold a bureaucracy that is free from corruption, collusion, and nepotism. The regulation also positions the digitalization of ASN management as an essential component of bureaucratic transformation. Accordingly, apparatus competency development should be directed not only toward enhancing knowledge but also toward cultivating work behaviours that can be sustained and consistently applied in public service delivery (Republic of Indonesia, 2023).

One of the strategic instruments for developing the competencies and character of state apparatus personnel is the Basic Training for Civil Servant Candidates, commonly referred to as *Latsar CPNS*. During the implementation of the 2019 CPNS Basic Training programme, character development was based on the ANEKA core values, comprising Accountability, Nationalism, Public Ethics, Quality Commitment, and Anti-Corruption, as stipulated in Regulation of the National Institute of Public Administration Number 12 of 2018. These values were internalized through classroom-based learning, habituation, mentoring, and workplace actualization activities. In subsequent policy developments, Regulation of the National Institute of Public Administration Number 12 of 2018 was revoked and replaced by Regulation Number 1 of 2021, which was later amended by Regulation Number 10 of 2021. The ASN work culture was also standardized through the *BerAKHLAK* Core Values, encompassing Service Orientation, Accountability, Competence, Harmony, Loyalty, Adaptability, and Collaboration (Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform, 2021; National Institute of Public Administration of the Republic of Indonesia, 2018, 2021a, 2021b).

This study was conducted with reference to the CPNS Basic Training policies and curriculum in effect in 2019. Therefore, the research instruments, indicators, and analytical framework were based on the ANEKA core values prescribed in Regulation of the National Institute of Public Administration Number 12 of 2018. Although this policy was subsequently revised through the implementation of the *BerAKHLAK* Core Values for ASN personnel, the findings of this study remain relevant because there is substantive continuity between the ANEKA values of Accountability, Nationalism, Public Ethics, Quality Commitment, and Anti-Corruption and the *BerAKHLAK* values of Service Orientation, Accountability, Competence, Harmony, Loyalty, Adaptability, and Collaboration.

The success of CPNS Basic Training cannot be assessed solely on the basis of academic scores, participant completion rates, or the quality of actualization projects undertaken during the training. It must also be evaluated in terms of the sustainability of behavioural change after participants return to their respective workplaces. The Kirkpatrick evaluation model places changes in workplace behaviour and organizational results as critical indicators for assessing training effectiveness at more substantive levels (Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2006). This perspective is consistent with the theory of transfer of training, which explains that the application of training outcomes is influenced by trainee characteristics, training design, and workplace support (Baldwin & Ford, 1988). Supervisory support, opportunities to apply acquired competencies, organizational climate, feedback mechanisms, and monitoring systems are therefore determining factors in whether the knowledge and values acquired during training develop into enduring work habits or gradually deteriorate after participants return to routine organizational conditions.

The issue of sustaining training outcomes is particularly relevant among CPNS Basic Training alumni within the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of North Sumatra Province. Preliminary research data indicate a discrepancy between participants' performance during the training process and the consistency with which they applied the core values after assuming their duties as fully appointed civil servants. Following the completion of the habituation phase and actualization seminars, alumni did not always receive adequate follow-up assistance from coaches or mentors. At the same time, they were required to adapt to existing work patterns, seniority-based relationships, infrastructure limitations, and administrative routines that could impede the sustainability of innovation. These conditions suggest that the internalization of ASN core values is not merely a matter of individual capability but is also closely associated with leadership support, the training transfer climate, post-training evaluation systems, and organizational readiness to facilitate changes in workplace behaviour.

To determine the priority level of post-training problems more systematically, this study employed the Urgency, Seriousness, and Growth (USG) analysis. The assessment covered five major issues identified through preliminary observations, document analysis, and discussions with training organizers and bureaucratic practitioners. The results of the analysis are presented in Table 1.

Table 1. Priority Analysis of Post-Training Problems Using the USG Method

No.	Post-Training Issue/Problem	U	S	G	Total Score	Rank
1	Insufficient continuous guidance and sustained commitment from mentors within work units in overseeing the implementation of the core values.	5	5	4	14	I
2	Discontinuity in the post-training monitoring and evaluation system conducted by the training provider, including coaches and <i>widyaiswara</i> or government training facilitators.	4	4	5	13	II
3	Limited infrastructure and inadequate utilization of information technology, which hinder the sustainability of public service innovations.	4	4	4	12	III
4	The strong influence of conventional workplace culture and resistance from senior employees to changes in alumni work behaviour.	4	3	4	11	IV
5	The low level of digital literacy among alumni in transforming their actualization plans into modern public service systems.	3	4	3	10	V

Notes: U = Urgency; S = Seriousness; G = Growth.

The results of the USG analysis indicate that insufficient continuous guidance and sustained commitment from mentors constituted the highest-priority issue, with a total score of 14. The discontinuity of monitoring and evaluation systems administered by the training institution ranked second, with a score of 13, while limitations in infrastructure and the utilization of information technology received a score of 12. These findings demonstrate that the sustainability of ASN core value implementation is influenced more substantially by workplace and institutional support than by the individual capabilities of alumni alone. Accordingly, post-training evaluation should place greater emphasis on the role of mentors, the continuity of monitoring mechanisms, organizational support, and the availability of adequate resources to sustain public service innovations.

Several previous studies have examined the evaluation of CPNS Basic Training, participant satisfaction, the development of apparatus character, and the implementation of coaching and mentoring. Affiani (2020) primarily emphasized the relationship between the quality of services provided by training organizers and participant satisfaction, whereas Rohaini et al. (2019) investigated the contribution of CPNS Basic Training to the development of professional and character-driven human resources within the state apparatus. Rohmah et al. (2020) demonstrated the importance of coaching and mentoring in supporting participants' actualization processes during CPNS Basic Training. Despite their important contributions, these studies have largely focused on processes and outcomes occurring during the training programme. Research evaluating the sustainability of core value implementation after participants have been fully appointed as civil servants remains relatively limited, particularly studies that integrate behavioural evaluation, organizational results, coach and mentor support, workplace culture, and the utilization of information technology within the context of religious bureaucracy.

In response to this research gap, the present study aims to evaluate the implementation of the ANEKA core values among alumni of the 2019 Group III CPNS Basic Training programme within the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of North Sumatra Province. The evaluation focuses on the consistency of core value application after training, the supporting and inhibiting factors affecting the transfer of training outcomes, the roles of coaches and mentors in sustaining behavioural change, and the contribution of value actualization to the quality of public service delivery. The novelty of this study lies in the integration of Kirkpatrick's Level 3—job behaviour—and Level 4—results—with the transfer of training theory to analyse the sustainability of ASN core values. The study also proposes a Post-Training Incubation Model that connects alumni, mentors, coaches, heads of work units, and training institutions through continuous mentoring and monitoring mechanisms. Although the research object is examined using the ANEKA framework, the findings remain relevant as a basis for strengthening the implementation of the BerAKHLAK Core Values because both frameworks position integrity, accountability, quality, adaptability, and service orientation as fundamental principles of state apparatus behaviour.

2. RESEARCH METHOD

This study employed a programme evaluation approach using a descriptive qualitative method and an evaluative case study design. This approach was selected to obtain an in-depth understanding of the sustainability of the implementation of the ANEKA core values after alumni of the Basic Training for Civil Servant Candidates returned to their respective work units. The evaluation was guided by Kirkpatrick's Level 3 model (job behaviour) to analyse changes in and the consistency of alumni work behaviour, as well as Level 4 (results) to identify the contribution of core value implementation to unit performance and the quality of public service delivery. At Level 4, organizational results were understood as changes identified through informants' experiences, service observations, and performance documents, rather than as causal relationships tested statistically. The theory of transfer of training was employed as an analytical framework to explain the influence of alumni characteristics, training design, leadership support, the role of supervisors, and the work environment on the sustainability of training outcomes (Baldwin & Ford, 1988; Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2006).

The study was conducted from January to May 2021 across several work units under the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of North Sumatra Province. These included the Provincial Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, district and municipal offices of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, public Islamic schools, Religious Affairs Offices, and public Islamic higher education institutions. The study involved 154 informants selected through purposive sampling based on their direct involvement, knowledge, and experience within the training and post-training ecosystem. The informants comprised 115 alumni of the 2019 Group III CPNS Basic Training programme, 15 colleagues, 11 mentors or immediate supervisors, seven heads of work units, and six coaches or *widyaiswara* from the Medan Religious Education and Training Centre. Alumni were selected to explore their experiences in actualizing the ANEKA values and the obstacles they encountered, while colleagues, mentors, heads of work units, and coaches were included to obtain comparative perspectives on behavioural change, the sustainability of innovation, organizational support, and the quality of public service delivery. The diversity of informant categories was intended to generate multiperspective data and strengthen source triangulation.

Table 2. Research Informants

No.	Informant Category	Number of Informants	Role and Focus of Information Collection
1	Alumni of the 2019 CPNS Basic Training Programme	115	To explore self-reflections, internal and external constraints, and the consistency of ANEKA value implementation.
2	Colleagues (Peer Group)	15	To provide objective assessments of changes in the alumni's daily workplace behaviour.
3	Mentors (Immediate Supervisors)	11	To evaluate work autonomy, discipline, innovation, and the sustainability of alumni actualization programmes.
4	Heads of Work Units (Heads of Offices/Work Units)	7	To assess broader impacts on public service quality and organizational performance.
5	Coaches (<i>Widyaiswara</i> at the Medan Religious Education and Training Centre)	6	To provide a broader perspective on training design and the limitations of post-training monitoring.
Total	All Informants	154	A combination of multiperspective data used to strengthen source triangulation.

Data were collected through semi-structured in-depth interviews, direct non-participant observation, and document analysis. The interviews were conducted using an interview guide covering the implementation of the ANEKA values, changes in workplace behaviour, the sustainability of actualization projects, the intensity of interaction with coaches and mentors, workplace constraints, the use of information technology, and changes in public service delivery. Observations were carried out by examining alumni behaviour while performing their duties, interacting with colleagues, delivering services to the public, and using technological devices within service units. The document analysis included 2019 Latsar actualization reports, Employee Performance Targets, work reports, standard operating procedures, and documents relating to service innovations developed by the alumni. Urgency, Seriousness, and Growth analysis was employed on a limited basis as a supporting technique to map the

priority of preliminary problems based on the assessment of a panel comprising academics, widyaiswara, and bureaucratic practitioners. The USG scores were not treated as the results of quantitative testing but rather as a basis for directing qualitative data collection toward the most pressing issues.

Data analysis was conducted interactively from the data collection stage through to the formulation of conclusions, following Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña (2014). The analytical process involved data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing and verification. Interview, observation, and documentary data were initially selected and coded according to the categories of Kirkpatrick's Level 3 and Level 4 models, the ANEKA values, transfer-of-training factors, the roles of coaches and mentors, workplace culture, organizational support, and public service quality. The coded data were subsequently presented in thematic matrices, comparative tables across informant categories, and interpretive narratives to identify patterns, relationships, differences in experience, and supporting and inhibiting factors. Data trustworthiness was maintained through source triangulation, methodological triangulation, prolonged and careful observation, verification of consistency between interview findings and documentary evidence, and member checking with relevant informants. Conclusions were established after consistent patterns had emerged across data sources and no substantively new information was identified that altered the principal research categories.

3. RESULT AND ANALYSIS

Evaluation of Post-Training Workplace Behaviour (Kirkpatrick Level 3: Job Behaviour)

The Level 3 evaluation indicates that the success demonstrated by alumni during the habituation phase did not fully develop into stable workplace behaviour after they returned to their respective work units. Based on interviews with 115 alumni, corroborated by the perspectives of colleagues, mentors, heads of work units, and coaches, most alumni were found to retain an understanding of the ANEKA core values. However, the intensity of their implementation differed from that demonstrated within the training environment. During Latsar, participants' behaviour was shaped by structured schedules, actualization targets, supervision, and assessment, which encouraged them to demonstrate accountability, discipline, creativity, and quality orientation more consistently. Once this structure ended, some innovative behaviours weakened and gradually readjusted to established workplace routines. This finding suggests that high performance during training primarily reflects the successful formation of behaviour within a controlled environment rather than conclusive evidence that these values had been fully internalized as professional habits. Within the Kirkpatrick framework, change at Level 3 can only be considered robust when the learned behaviours continue to be applied consistently under actual workplace conditions, rather than solely while participants remain under the supervision of a training programme (Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2006).

The most visible decline occurred in the values of Accountability and Quality Commitment, particularly in relation to the sustainability of service innovations. During the actualization stage, alumni were able to develop various forms of procedural simplification, information media, data management mechanisms, and technology-based services. However, some of these innovations were discontinued after the alumni became fully appointed civil servants because they did not receive adequate budgetary support, structural recognition, allocation of responsibilities, or opportunities for further development. This condition demonstrates that the discontinuation of innovation cannot be interpreted solely as a decline in individual motivation. A more fundamental problem lies in the failure to institutionalize actualization outcomes within the procedures, performance targets, and service systems of the respective work units. Innovation continued to be regarded as an individual project undertaken by alumni to fulfil graduation requirements, rather than as an organizational asset that should be maintained and further developed. Research on the transfer of training indicates that individual capability can generate sustainable behavioural change only when it is supported by relevant training design, opportunities to apply acquired competencies, and an organizational climate that reinforces new behaviours (Kodwani & Prashar, 2021; Yaqub et al., 2021).

Conventional workplace culture and seniority-based relationships constituted social mechanisms that further constrained the transfer of post-training behaviour. Alumni who attempted to introduce more transparent, efficient, and digitally based working practices did not always receive positive responses from their workplace environment. In some cases, reform initiatives were perceived as disrupting established practices or as attempts by junior employees to distinguish themselves in front

of more senior personnel. This condition placed alumni in a dilemma between maintaining innovative behaviour and preserving social acceptance within the workplace. The decision to reduce the intensity of innovation in order to avoid conflict does not necessarily indicate that alumni had abandoned the values learned during training. Rather, it may be interpreted as a form of defensive adaptation to the distribution of power within the organization. Alumni tended to retain behaviours that did not generate resistance while withholding initiatives that required procedural changes or the involvement of other employees. The workplace environment therefore functions not merely as the setting in which training outcomes are applied, but also as an arena that may either reinforce or suppress alumni confidence in translating values into action. Supervisory support is consequently crucial because it can sustain transfer motivation, legitimize new ideas, and protect employees when they encounter organizational resistance (Govaerts & Dochy, 2014; Ragini & Ghosh, 2022).

Meanwhile, the values of Public Ethics and Anti-Corruption demonstrated stronger continuity in easily observable behaviours, including punctuality, friendliness, courtesy, compliance with regulations, and the refusal of unauthorized gifts. Nevertheless, the internalization of these values did not always extend to more complex practices, such as the productive management of working time, responsible use of office facilities, willingness to challenge inefficient procedures, and resistance to administrative inaction. This pattern indicates a selective transfer of behaviour: values supported by clear rules and direct consequences tended to endure, whereas values requiring critical reflection, moral courage, and collective change were more likely to weaken. The Level 3 evaluation findings should therefore not be interpreted as evidence of the complete failure of Latsar, but rather as evidence of behavioural change that remains partial, situational, and vulnerable to regression in the absence of organizational reinforcement. Latsar has established a foundation of knowledge and ethical orientation; however, its sustainability requires post-training monitoring, exemplary leadership, collegial support, opportunities to apply competencies, and the integration of actualization projects into organizational performance systems. Ultimately, the transfer of training is the product of interaction between alumni readiness and workplace conditions, rather than solely an outcome of the quality of learning provided during the training programme (Baldwin & Ford, 1988; Ragini & Ghosh, 2022; Yaqub et al., 2021).

Analysis of the Intensity of Post-Training Relationships with Coaches and Mentors

The findings indicate that mentoring relationships underwent a fundamental change after the alumni completed Latsar and fully returned to their respective work units. Based on interviews with six coaches and eleven mentors, corroborated by information from alumni, colleagues, and heads of work units, the intensity of post-training assistance tended to be lower than that provided during the habituation phase. During Latsar, mentoring relationships were structured through consultation schedules, monitoring records, actualization targets, seminars, and administrative requirements that regularly brought participants into contact with coaches and mentors. Once all formal stages had been completed, these relationships were not sustained through a structured monitoring mechanism. This pattern indicates that the intensity of assistance provided during training had not developed into a continuous learning relationship but remained dependent on programme regulations and administrative obligations. Therefore, the weakening of post-training relationships does not merely reflect a lack of personal commitment among coaches and mentors. Rather, it reveals an institutional design gap in which mentoring has not yet been incorporated into the cycle of alumni evaluation and professional development (Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2006; National Institute of Public Administration of the Republic of Indonesia, 2018).

The relationship between alumni and coaches demonstrated the clearest form of discontinuity. During Latsar, coaches assisted participants in formulating problems, preparing actualization plans, selecting problem-solving strategies, and reflecting on the relationship between actualization activities and the ANEKA values. However, these interactions generally ended after the actualization seminar because the Medan Religious Education and Training Centre lacked an operational mandate, budget allocation, workload distribution mechanism, and dedicated communication platform for conducting post-training monitoring. This finding demonstrates that the coach's function remains limited to facilitating programme completion rather than serving as a partner in the alumni's continuing professional development. Consequently, when alumni encountered resistance from senior employees, technological limitations, or difficulties in sustaining innovation, they no longer had access to a source of consultation that understood the background and objectives of their actualization projects. Under these circumstances, the problem was not merely the loss of communication with coaches but also the absence of a reflective space in which alumni could adapt their innovations to organizational realities. The effectiveness of coaching lies precisely in reflective processes, feedback, and support that help

individuals sustain behavioural change when confronting complex workplace situations (Rohmah et al., 2020; Theeboom et al., 2014).

Unlike coaches, mentors continued to interact with alumni because they worked within the same organizational units. However, the nature of these relationships shifted from developmental mentoring to routine official interaction. During the habituation phase, mentors approved the selected actualization issues, validated the benefits of the proposed activities, facilitated access to organizational resources, and provided protection for the implementation of innovations. After the training was completed, communication increasingly focused on task allocation, the delivery of instructions, and the achievement of administrative targets, while discussions concerning the development of innovations became more limited. This shift indicates that structural proximity does not automatically result in meaningful mentoring. Mentors may continue to meet alumni frequently while no longer performing the developmental functions of reinforcement, feedback provision, and protection of change-oriented ideas. Heavy workloads and the absence of performance indicators linking mentor achievement to alumni development resulted in mentoring being treated as an additional responsibility. These findings confirm that the quality of mentoring is determined more by the developmental functions performed than by the frequency of administrative contact between mentors and alumni (Martoredjo, 2015; Van Vianen et al., 2018).

Table 3. Analytical Matrix of the Intensity of Post-Training Relationships and the Roles of Coaches and Mentors

Supervisory Element	Communication Intensity	Role During Latsar	Post-Training Role: Empirical Findings	Impact on Alumni
Coach (Widyaiswara at the Medan Religious Education and Training Centre)	Very low, with only 0–5% post-training communication	Guided the design of actualization projects using the GROW Model and served as the principal source of academic motivation.	Communication ceased entirely because of regulatory limitations, the absence of a budget for monitoring and evaluation, and teaching responsibilities for subsequent training cohorts.	Alumni lost access to methodological consultants and experienced a sense of academic abandonment.
Mentor (Immediate Supervisor within the Work Unit)	Low to moderate, largely limited to routine official instructions	Approved the selected actualization issue, validated the benefits of the innovation, and acted as an organizational protector.	Reverted to a purely structural supervisory role, paid limited attention to the sustainability of innovations, and became absorbed in daily administrative routines.	Alumni lost an organizational champion for their innovations, resulting in demotivation and conformity to established workplace practices.

The comparison between relationships with coaches and mentors reveals two distinct forms of mentoring gaps. In relationships with coaches, the gap emerged because communication was rarely sustained after the programme had formally ended. In relationships with mentors, by contrast, interaction continued but gradually lost its developmental orientation. Both conditions required alumni to sustain the actualization of ANEKA values and public service innovations with only limited support. In organizational environments that were not yet fully receptive to change, the absence of methodological consultation from coaches and the weakening of organizational protection from mentors could encourage alumni to reduce their initiatives, readjust to established routines, and regard actualization projects merely as completed graduation requirements. These findings do not imply that mentoring directly determines all aspects of alumni behaviour. Rather, they indicate that continuity of support constitutes an important condition for the effective transfer of training. Post-training evaluation should therefore be strengthened through periodic mentoring mechanisms, clear allocation of responsibilities, communication platforms connecting alumni and supervisors, and the integration of innovation sustainability into the performance indicators of work units and mentors (Baldwin & Ford, 1988; Kaswan, 2012; Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2006).

The Impact of Core Value Actualization on the Quality of Information Technology-Based Public Services

The evaluation at the results level, corresponding to Kirkpatrick's Level 4, was directed toward analysing the observable impacts of the alumni's actualization of the ANEKA values on the improvement of public service quality across work units under the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of North Sumatra Province (Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2006). Public service quality was assessed using the five principal service-quality dimensions developed by Zeithaml, Parasuraman, and Berry (1990): tangibles, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, and empathy. The analysis focused particularly on how the accommodation and utilization of information technology functioned as catalysts for realizing these dimensions of service quality.

The results of participatory observation and document analysis demonstrate that, in work units led by heads who exhibited strong visionary commitment, the actualization of the Quality Commitment value through the utilization of information technology generated substantial improvements in service quality. For example, in several subdistrict Religious Affairs Offices, Latsar alumni successfully implemented integrated online marriage registration systems, spreadsheet-based database applications for the inventory of waqf assets, and interactive digital information platforms. These innovations significantly enhanced the dimensions of reliability and responsiveness by enabling members of the public to obtain greater certainty regarding processing times, transparency of service costs, and faster service delivery compared with previous manual systems (Zeithaml et al., 1990). Bureaucratic procedures that had previously been complicated and vulnerable to illegal levies were effectively streamlined, thereby strengthening the systemic application of the Anti-Corruption value.

However, these achievements were not evenly distributed across all regions of North Sumatra. In remote areas and district offices of the Ministry of Religious Affairs located far from the provincial capital, the implementation of information technology-based innovations encountered substantial infrastructural constraints. The principal barriers included unstable internet connectivity, an insufficient number of computers with adequate technical specifications in service units, and low levels of digital literacy among members of the public using these services. These factors prevented digital applications and service systems that had been carefully designed by alumni during Latsar from being operated optimally after the completion of the training programme.

These conditions confirm the proposition of quality management theory that high-quality public services cannot be produced solely through the competence of individual employees. Rather, they require the integrated support of well-developed organizational quality-management planning, adequate physical infrastructure, and the digital readiness of the organizational ecosystem as a whole (Zeithaml et al., 1990). The sustainability of public service innovation can therefore only be ensured when there is close alignment between a visionary basic training curriculum and the information technology development blueprint adopted by institutions at both central and regional levels.

4. CONCLUSION

This study concludes that the Basic Training for Civil Servant Candidates has successfully established alumni's initial understanding of and orientation toward the ANEKA core values. However, the sustainability of these values in workplace behaviour has not been consistently maintained after participants returned to their respective work units. At the behavioural level, values related to discipline, public service ethics, and regulatory compliance tended to be more enduring. In contrast, accountability, quality commitment, willingness to innovate, and efforts to prevent ineffective practices remained strongly influenced by conventional workplace culture, resistance to change, infrastructural limitations, and weak organizational support. Post-training relationships with coaches were rarely sustained, while interactions with mentors continued but largely shifted into routine official relationships and did not yet function as developmental mentoring. Consequently, actualization projects were not fully integrated into organizational work systems and tended to be regarded merely as requirements for completing the training programme. Nevertheless, in work units supported by committed leadership and adequate facilities, the actualization of the ANEKA values contributed to procedural simplification, greater utilization of information technology, improved service responsiveness, and increased transparency in public service delivery. Therefore, the effectiveness of Latsar is determined not only by the quality of learning provided during the training programme but also by the continuity of post-training monitoring, the strengthening of coach and mentor functions, the institutionalization of innovation, and leadership commitment to developing a workplace environment that supports sustainable behavioural change.

References

- Affiani, Musfarita. 2020. "Pengaruh Kualitas Pelayanan Pada Kepuasan Peserta Pelatihan Dasar CPNS Kabupaten Tebo Provinsi Jambi." *Jurnal Ilmiah Ekonomi dan Bisnis* 11(1): 45-55.
- Amanillah, Nurul Fitriyanti, Universitas Islam, and Negeri Antasari. 2020. "Pengaruh Coaching Dan Mentoring Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan Pt. Bank Bni Syariah Kc Banjarmasin."
- Dayat Nurhayat, SW. 2016. "EVALUASI DAN PENGEMBANGAN MODEL COACHING DALAM PENINGKATAN KOMPETENSI KEPEMIMPINAN PADA PENDIDIKAN DAN PELATIHAN KEPEMIMPINAN TINGKAT II DI PUSAT KAJIAN DAN PENDIDIKAN DAN PELATIHAN APARATUR I LEMBAGA." *Jurnal Wacana Kinerja* 19(2): 89-120. <http://jwk.bandung.lan.go.id/ojs/index.php/jwk/article/view/207>.
- Erlina. (2011). *Metodologi Penelitian*. Medan, Indonesia: USU Press.
- Gould, D and Pierce, S and Cowburn, IHJ and Driska, A. 2017. "How an Elite Coach 's Philosophy Drives His Coaching to Facilitate Psychological Skills Development of Young Athletes : A Case Study of J Robinson 1 Revised Date of Submission : August 31 , 2016 Author Note The Authors Would like to Thank J Robinson And." *International Sport Coaching Journal / ISCJ* 4: 13-37. <https://doi.org/10.1123/iscj.2016-0052>.
- Iskandar, *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*, Gaung Persada, Jakarta, 2009 cet.1
- Imanuddin, Bayu, and IGN Putra Suryanata. 2019. "Jurnal Manajemen Dan Bisnis." *Jurnal Manajemen dan Bisnis* 8(2): 342-53. <http://journal.stieindragiri.ac.id/index>
- J.S Badudu, Sutan Muhammad Zain, *Kamus Umum Bahasa Indonesia*, Jakarta, Pustaka Sinar Harapan, 2010,
- Kaswan. (2012). *Coaching dan Mentoring, Untuk Pengembangan SDM dan Peningkatan Kinerja Organisasi*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Lembaga Administrasi Negara Republik Indonesia. 2021. "Keputusan Kepala Lembaga Administrasi Negara Nomor : 93/K.1/PDP.07/2021 Tentang Pedoman Penyelenggaraa Pelatihan Calon Pegawai Negeri Sipil."
- Lembaga Administrasi Republik Indonesia. 2018. "Peraturan Lembaga Administrasi Negara Republik Indonesia Nomor 12 Tahun 2018 Tentang Pelatihan Dasar Calon Pegawai Negeri Sipil."
- . 2021. *Keputusan Kepala Lembaga Administrasi Negara Nomor : 94/K.1/PDP.07/2021 Tentang: Kurikulum Pelatihan Dasar Calon Pegawai Negeri Sipil*.
- Lembaran Negara Ri Tahun 2014. 2014. "UU ASN No. 5 Tahun 2014." *Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 5 Tahun 2014 Tentang Aparatur Sipil Negara: 1-105*. [https://peraturan.bpk.go.id/Home/Download/27837/UU Nomor 05 Tahun 2014.pdf](https://peraturan.bpk.go.id/Home/Download/27837/UU%20Nomor%2005%20Tahun%202014.pdf).
- Lexy J. Moleong, *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*, Remaja Rosdakarya, Bandung, 2010, cet. 18,
- Lijan Poltak Sinambela, dkk., *Reformasi Pelayanan Publik*, Bumi Aksara, Jakarta, 2013
- Martoredjo, Nikodemus Thomas. 2015. "Peran Dimensi Mentoring Dalam Upaya Peningkatan Kualitas Sumber Daya Manusia." *Humaniora* 6(4): 444.
- Rohaini, Rahmi Astuti, Nandang Hidayat, and Entis Sutisna. 2019. "Evaluasi Pelatihan Dasar Calon Pegawai Negeri Sipil Dalam Mendukung Terwujudnya Sumberdaya Manusia Profesional Berkarakter." *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*.
- Rohmah, Ana Fatkhur, I Made Sudana, and Titi Prihatin. 2020. "The Implementation of Coaching and Mentoring on Basic Training For Civil Servant Candidates (CPNS) in Religious Education and Training Center Semarang." *Educational Management* 9(1): 101-9.
- Semiawan, Conny R. "Metode Penelitian Kualitatif: Jenis, Karakteristik Dan Keunggulannya."
- Rohaini, Rahmi Astuti, Nandang Hidayat, and Entis Sutisna. 2019. "Evaluasi Pelatihan Dasar Calon Pegawai Negeri Sipil Dalam Mendukung Terwujudnya Sumberdaya Manusia Profesional Berkarakter." *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*.
- Rohmah, Ana Fatkhur, I Made Sudana, and Titi Prihatin. 2020. "The Implementation of Coaching and Mentoring on Basic Training For Civil Servant Candidates (CPNS) in Religious Education and Training Center Semarang." *Educational Management* 9(1): 101-9.
- Semiawan, Conny R. "Metode Penelitian Kualitatif: Jenis, Karakteristik Dan Keunggulannya."
- Sutrisno, Wiriadi, and Suwiryono Cokro. 2018. "Analisis Pengaruh Edupreneurship Dan Mentoring Terhadap Peningkatan Daya Saing Lulusan Perguruan Tinggi." *Research and Development Journal of Education* 5(1): 114.
- Suharsimi Arikunto, *Prosedur Penelitian Suatu Pendekatan Praktek*, (Jakarta : PT. Rineka Cipta, 2002, Cet.XIV),

- Theeboom, Tim, Bianca Beersma, and Annelies E.M. van Vianen. 2014. "Does Coaching Work? A Meta-Analysis on the Effects of Coaching on Individual Level Outcomes in an Organizational Context." *Journal of Positive Psychology* 9(1): 1–18. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/17439760.2013.837499>.
- Van Vianen, Annelies E.M. et al. 2018. "Career Mentoring in Context: A Multilevel Study on Differentiated Career Mentoring and Career Mentoring Climate." *Human Resource Management* 57(2): 583–99.
- Yapardi, Nirwaty, and Dan Milawaty. 2016. "Sebagai Pendekatan Alternatif Dalam Proses." *Jurnal Transformasi Administrasi* 6(Coaching). <http://jta.lan.go.id/index.php/jta/article/view/130>.